

That 補文と zero-that 補文の選択と動詞の意味—意味的統語研究

国立岐阜工業高等専門学校 講師 土屋知洋

tsuchiya@gifu-nct.ac.jp

0 . はじめに

0.1 問題の所在

- (1) a. I think that it's gonna rain. [THAT] Borkin (1984: 87)  
b. I think \_\_\_ it's gonna rain. [ZERO] 推断的な意味  
以降、下(波)線部・“ ”はすべて発表者による
- (2) I hope (that) you realize (that) they said a few words on there. 意味に相違なし  
Biber *et al.* (1999: 680)
- (3) a. I resent \*(that) they took it on themselves to call in the vote. 安井 (1981: 183)  
b. I demand \*(that) he see the president now. Haegeman & Gueron (1999: 108)  
c. Francis whispered \*(that) we should turn down the stereo. 桑原 & 松山(2001: 28)
- (4) ?I doubt he'll do it. Bolinger (1972: 40)

0.2 研究対象外となる類似構文

- (5) a. Your uncle says that *when my present shoes start to pinch*, he'd be pleased to fit me. 渡辺 (1989: 255)  
b. I believe that you have good qualities, *and that* you'll get on in the world. *Ibid.* (254)  
c. \*I ask you be there. (I ask you, be there. I ask (that) you be there)  
Bolinger (1972: 23)

0.3 主張点

- (6) a. 話し手・書き手が命題内容に対して断定可能、或いは断定が介在する動詞(の意味)では[ZERO]を従えることが可能  
b. 話し手・書き手の意図、すなわち動詞の意味の違いが型(form)に影響を与える

1 先行研究概観

- (7) 量的(統計的)アプローチによる検証：数値の提示が中心で実例を軽視傾向  
a. Elsness (1984): 書き言葉  
b. Yaguchi & Iyeiri (2007): 公式スピーチ(thinkに焦点)  
c. Biber *et al.* (1999): レジスター
- (8) 質的アプローチによる検証：個々の動詞に焦点。ZERO・THATの包括的原理は不明  
a. Storms (1966): 客観 主観  
b. Bolinger (1972): 頻度・主節/従節の衝突・照応  
c. 大江 (1988): *wish* 間接 直接(感)  
d. Nawa (2006): *hope* 「期待」 「印象」・文体  
e. Yaguchi (2001): 距離 / 分析的 非分析的 / 語用論的要因 / 認識的動詞の検証

- (9) 通時的アプローチによる検証：個々の動詞に於ける文法化による動詞の意味変化を示唆  
 a. Thompson & Mulac (1991): 会話に於ける認知的動詞の検証  
 b. Palander-Collins (1997): *think* の通時的検証  
 c. 秋元 (2002): *I dare say*

## 2. 土屋 (2008a) (2008b) (2009) : “ 断定性 ” と [ZERO]

### 2.1 “ 断定性 ”

- (10) 話し手・書き手が that 節内の真偽を判断できるもの 桑原&松山 (2001: 169)  
 (11) a. Hooper (1975)がまとめる断定・非断定述語を参考 APPENDIX (p.8)

b.

動詞の意味分類		Examples	[PC]	[ZERO]
非断定動詞	Neg. assertive	(4)(16)	×	?
	True factive	(3a)	×	×
	Suasive	(3b)	×	×
	Subjunctive	(14b)(14c)	×	(wish)
	manner of speaking	(3c)(12)	?	?
断定動詞	Strong assertive	(2)		
	Weak assertive	(1)		
	Semi-factive	(2)		

注：表中の“ ”, “?”, “×”はそれぞれ“容認”, “型を従えるか疑わしい”, “非容認”を示す  
 : 表中の[PC]とは *Parenthetical Clause* (挿入句) の略  
 : Hooper (1975)で扱っていない *Subjunctive* (仮定) は[PC]がとれないことから本発表では非断定動詞と分類する。

### 2.2 非断定動詞に見られる [ZERO]

#### 2.2.1 Manner of speaking verbs ( 発話様態動詞 ): 土屋 (2008b)

- (12) a. These days the Met. are always moaning\_\_\_they're short of staff. BNC  
 b. “I brushed past a girl as I went to the toilet and she yelled\_\_\_ I'd done it deliberately.” BNC  
 Cf. 上記の動詞は howl, shriek などと比べ伝達の意味を強く帯びる

#### 2.2.2 動詞 wish : 土屋 (2009)

- (13) a. 非事実的願望を表す “ S + wish (that) ~ ” は生成過程で現状の判断 ( 断定 ) 不可欠  
 b. to want something to be true although you know it is either impossible or unlikely LDCE<sup>5</sup> (sv. *wish*)
- (14) a. \*I wish I changed my job. [未来指示の単一行為・出来事] Tregidgo (1984: 49)  
 b. I wish I knew his address. [状態・習慣的・反復的] 内木場 (2003: 44)  
 c. Have you seen anything like that? That's the lungs. I wish\_\_\_I could talk longer... BNC
- (15) Barbara wishes that Kim's weaning *be* accomplished with minimal emotional pain.  
 「要求」の *wish* : Non-Assertive Wordbanks (USw)

Cf. I *really* hope that you do not take offense in that way. 「“要求”に類似した期待」  
BNC

### 2.2.3 動詞 doubt : 土屋 (2008a)

(16) a. I don't doubt \_\_\_ this place is full of rogues. BNC

b. Economist Howard Roctel says the figures are reflection of a deteriorating economy and doubts \_\_\_ a recession can be avoided.

Howard: I don't think we can avoid continued sluggishness ... . Wordbanks (usS)

c. I doubt \_\_\_ they would have noticed had she crawled into the house with a broken leg. BNC

(17) 英米差と通時的に類似した意味を有する断定動詞 suspect の影響を受けてきた

(18) a. Wordbanks [spoken]のデータ：節をとる肯定文の doubt

<米> 17([ZERO])/36(総数) <英> 2/20

Cf. BNC に於いても 225 件中 4 件のみ肯定文で[ZERO]生起

b. He stretched out his hand and tapped the corpse just above the knees. “These are sword wounds. I suspect \_\_\_ the King was surrounded and was lightly wounded by arrows. BNC

## 2.3 本節のまとめと本発表で扱う具体的な問題点

### 2.3.1 本節のまとめ

(19) a. 通時的発達過程において、類推から断定動詞の特徴を持つようになった動詞は [ZERO]を従えることが可能。

b. 話し手・書き手の断定が生成過程に於いて介在する場合には[ZERO]を従える。

c. 生成過程を含め、断定性を含まない・介在しない動詞は[ZERO]を基本的に従えることはない。

### 2.3.2 本発表で扱う具体的な問題点

(20) a. 断定動詞と分類される動詞は、どのような要因で型(form)の選択がなされるのか？

b. 従える型が異なる場合、動詞の意味はどのような関係にあるのか？

## 3 . 断定動詞に見られる意味の相違と型

### 3.1 本発表で焦点を当てる断定動詞

(21) [弱断定(weak-assertive)動詞]

a. **guess**: to say or decide what you think is true, without being certain about it.

MED<sup>2</sup> (s.v. guess)

b. **think**: to believe something based on facts or ideas / to have something in your mind

Ibid. (s.v. think)

(22) [強断定(strong-assertive)動詞]

- a. **say**: to express something using words / to give information or orders in writing, numbers, pictures, etc. MED<sup>2</sup> (s.v. say)
- b. **insist**: to say very firmly that something must happen or must be done / to keep saying very firmly that something is true, even when other people will not believe you Ibid. (s.v. insist)

(23) [半叙実(semi-factive)動詞]

**know**: to have learned or found out about something / to feel certain about something MED<sup>2</sup> (s.v. know)

### 3.2 量的調査

#### 3.2.1 量的調査

(24) 各意味範疇に含まれる動詞と各型の共起頻度

意味範疇	動詞	合計	[THAT]	[ZERO]	[PC]
弱断定	guess	262(US:254)	3(US:3) [1%]	160(US:156) [59%]	99(US:95) [40%]
	think	1527	297 [20%]	1062 [70%]	168 [10%]
強断定	say	4079	884 [22%]	2965 [73%]	230 [5%]
	insist	405	221 [54%]	169 [43%]	15 [3%]
半叙実	know	464	224 [48%]	223 [48%]	17 [4%] “you know”以外

注：insist の検証では次のような Suasive の意味を有する用例は非断定のため除外：

President Ranasinghe Premadasa of Sri Lanka has insisted that the summit *should* be held there this year. Wordbanks (UK:S)

：guess (that) ~ を従える用例のほとんどが米用法。

#### 3.2.2 量的調査

(25) 各動詞間に見られる[ZERO]生起の有意差

各動詞と[ZERO]の頻度差	二乗検定結果と有意差	
think – guess	7.4	$p < 0.01$
say – insist	167.8	$p < 0.001$
think – know	71.8	$p < 0.001$
know – say	120.7	$p < 0.001$
know – insist	3.5	$p = 3.5$
think – say	5.4	$p < 0.05$

注：数値は 二乗検定値を示す。また有意差の判定は、各基準を提示している。

### 3.2.3 量的調査結果

- (26) a. 弱断定動詞に分類される動詞であっても“根拠に基づいて思考する”という意味を持つ think は[THAT]を頻繁にとる傾向が見られる。同様に、強断定の場合も“情報伝達のみ”を担う say に比べ“確固たる意思に基づき‘主張する’” insistの方が圧倒的に[THAT]に従える傾向にある。
- b. “知識の保持”と“確信”を表す know は、guess や think らと同様の思考を表す動詞ではあるが[THAT]を頻繁に従える。
- (27) a. 同じ意味範疇に分類されている場合でも、各動詞の語義に“根拠”“確信”を含む動詞とそれ以外では[ZERO]に従える差には優位な差が見られる。
- b. 意味範疇を横断的に見た際、思考を担う動詞 (Quirk *et al.* (1985)でいう private) に比べ発話を担う動詞 (public)の方が[THAT]で使用される頻度は高い。

## 3.3 質的調査

### 3.3.1 動詞 guess

- (28) a. Siegel: I guess\_\_\_\_I only have one other question about this demonstration, ... .  
Wordbanks (USs)
- b. Pleuf: The television was invented--the first age to second age was from black and white to color, and third age is interactive. Everybody's waiting for interactive, so we all guess that the third age of television is going to be that.  
Wordbanks (USs)

### 3.3.2 動詞 think

- (29) a. Johnston: I think\_\_\_\_it (= the endorsement of Republican senators: added by the present author) looks very good for my win on Saturday.  
Bernett: The Republicans' endorsement of Johnston is, however, more backhanded than wholehearted.  
Wordbanks (USs)
- b. Where does your information come from, and how certain can you be that the picture is accurate? we had a series of researchers go out into Jordan, Egypt, Bahrain, Saudi Arabia. They talked to people who'd just come from Kuwait. So I think that the picture that we have is reasonably good. Wordbanks (UKs)

### 3.3.3 動詞 say

- (30) a. ... a lawyer representing the fundamentalists says\_\_\_\_he will be taking legal action against the ban. Wordbanks (UKs)
- b. Would you say that your life is better or worse than your parents' lives were when they were your age?  
Unidentified Woman #4: (Through Translator) I *would* say that mine is much more difficult. Today life is harder. Wordbanks (USs)

### 3.3.4 動詞 insist

- (31) a. ... if senators received funds from Keating with an understanding that some action was expected in return, then they may have violated Senate rules. The five senators insist that they did nothing wrong. Wordbanks (USs)
- b. Khamil Krispojc and Gordana Knesevic recently won awards for courage in journalism, but they insist \_\_\_ they are no braver than the average person in Sarajevo who goes out every day to work or gather water. Wordbanks (USs)

### 3.3.5 動詞 know

- (32) a. ... I know that I have to be quite wary, since I know \_\_\_ I live alone and be very, very careful in this kind of weather. Wordbanks (USs)
- b. Researchers have long known that certain diseases appear to run in families, and ... Wordbanks (USs)

## 3.4 調査結果

- (33) a. [ZERO]では根拠が希薄で、話し手・書き手による独断的断定を示す。従って、動詞本来の語義より意味が弱く、推断的な思考・発言を表す傾向有
- b. [THAT]では根拠に依存した客観的・反芻的断定を示す。従って、動詞本来の語義、或いは本来の語義より強い意味を表す傾向有

## 4 . インフォーマント調査

### 4.1 調査

- (34) a. The television was invented--the third age is interactive. Everybody's waiting for interactive, so I do guess { that / } the third age of television is going to be that.
- b. A world wide opinion poll of scientists involved with the climate, has revealed some interesting findings. 76% think { that / } people are causing global warming, but only 41 % think { that / } there is scientific evidence for that.
- c. He (=Ken Griffey, Jr.) is also a bona fide contender for this year's most valuable player award. And junior knows { that / } his dad can help him get even better. Ken Griffey, Jr.: Basically, you know, if I do something wrong he'll just come over and say, ... .
- d. In an official statement, the authorities in Seoul insist { that / } the discussions must not be linked to any other issue, ... .
- e. Khamil and Gordana recently won awards for courage in journalism, but they insist { that / } they are no braver than the average person in Sarajevo who goes out every day to work or gather water.
- f. [YOU] I know { that / } I have to be quite wary, since I know { that / } I live

alone and be very, very careful in this kind of weather ... .

- g. Where does your information come from, and how certain can you be that the picture is accurate? [ YOU ]: We had a series of researchers go out into Jordan, Egypt, Bahrain, Saudi Arabia. They talked to people who'd just come from Kuwait. So I think **{ that / \_\_\_\_\_ }** the picture that we have is reasonably good
- h. Would you say that your life is better or worse than your parents' lives were when they were your age? [ YOU ]: I would say **{ that / \_\_\_\_\_ }** mine is much more difficult. Today life is harder.
- i. [ YOU ]: Gorbachev said **{ that / \_\_\_\_\_ }** Yeltsin was trying to create a political confrontation. He said **{ that / \_\_\_\_\_ }** it was strange. He obviously wanted to a stronger word than that , but ... .

## 4.2 調査結果とまとめ

### 4.2.1 インフォーマント調査の結果

(35)

	[THAT]	[ZERO]	[[THAT] & [ZERO]]	原文の型
(34a)	6	1	4	[THAT]
(34b)	5	0	6	[THAT]
(34b')	1	7	3	[ZERO]
(34c)	5	3	3	[THAT]
(34d)	8	1	2	[THAT]
(34e)	6	3	2	[ZERO]
(34f)	6	0	5	[THAT]
(34f')	5	4	2	[ZERO]
(34g)	4	5	2	[THAT]
(34h)	6	1	4	[THAT]
(34i)	7	1	3	[THAT]
(34i')	3	4	4	[ZERO]

注：各設問のプライムは設問に二つの問題がある場合の二つ目の設問の回答を示す。

： [THAT] & [ZERO] はその場面で両型（形式）が選択可能なことを指す。

### 4.2.2 本調査のまとめ

- (36) a. インフォーマントの反応は、量的・質的調査の結果を裏付けるものであった。つまり、命題内容をインフォーマントが明示的根拠に基づいて断定する際は[THAT]を選択し、根拠が明示されていない場合は[ZERO]を選ぶ傾向が見られた。
- b. インフォーマント調査では、原文の書き手の意図までは測りきれないという限界が露呈した。今後のインフォーマント調査の課題ともなる。

(37)

断定過程	根拠依存 (客観・反芻)	独断 (主観・直感)
型	[THAT]	[ZERO]
動詞の意味	語義本来・強い意味	本来の語義より弱い意味

注：話し手及び書き手の断定過程・動詞の意味と型との関係はあくまで段階的なもの。

### おわりに

(38) a. (that)節を従える動詞の内、話し手・書き手の断定を有する、或いは断定を介在する動詞のみが[ZERO]をとることが許される傾向有。

b. [ZERO]を従えうる断定(的)動詞は、話し手・書き手が命題内容を根拠に基づいて断定しているかどうかによってとる型([THAT][ZERO])に違いが生起。

(39) a. 断定動詞の[THAT]では、根拠に基づいた思考・発言のため本来の語義ないし本来の語義よりも強い意味を有する傾向有。

b. 断定動詞の[ZERO]では、独断で思考・発言をするため推断的な意味となり、本来の語義よりも弱い意味となる傾向有。

c. 各断定動詞の意味と型との関係は、必ずしも判然としている訳でなく段階性が存在。

## APPENDIX

Assertive predicates を扱った Hooper (1975)の表の関係部分抜粋

Non-factive			Factive		
Assertive		Non-Assertive	Assertive (Semi-factive)	Non-Assertive (True factive)	
Weak-	Strong -				
	(a)	(b)			
<b>think</b> <b>guess</b> suppose expect imagine guess seem appear figure	<b>say</b> <b>insist</b> admit claim declare emphasize indicate predict remark suggest testify verify など	<b>hope</b> <b>suspect</b> agree calculate decide estimate surmise など	<b>doubt</b> neg. + strong	<b>know</b> discover learn note observe predict realize see	regret amuse bother care <b>resent</b> など

注：Suasive に当たる *recommend* や Subjunctive の動詞 *wish* は Hooper (1975)の表には含まれていない。これは Hooper の研究対象が“完全な補文(時制を伴った)をもつ述語を余すところなく分類”のためだと考えられる。

：上記の表は Hooper (1975)より *be afraid* などの形容詞を省いたものを提示している。

## 参考文献

### [文献]

- 秋元実治. 2002. 『文法化とイディオム化』. 東京：ひつじ書房.
- 安藤貞雄. 2005. 『現代英文法講義』. 東京：開拓社.
- Biber, D., S. Johnsson, G. Leech, S. Conrad and E. Finegan. 1999. *Longman grammar of spoken and written English*. London: Longman.
- Bolinger, D. 1972. *That's that*. The Hague: Mouton.
- Borkin, A. 1984. *Problems in form and function*. Ablex.
- Elsness, J. 1984. "That or Zero? A look the choice of object clause connective in a corpus of American English", *English studies: A journal of English language and literature, Vol. 65*. Lisse: Swets & Zeitlinger.
- Fowler, H. W. 1927. *A dictionary of modern English usage*. Oxford: Oxford university press.
- Haegeman, L. and J. Guéron. 1999. *English grammar: a generative perspective*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Hooper, B. J. 1975. "On assertive predicates", *Syntax and semantics*, vol. 4, 91- 123. Academic Press.
- 小西友七[編]. 1985. 『英語基本動詞辞典』. 東京：研究社.
- 桑原和生・松山哲也. 2000. 『補文構造』. 東京：研究社.
- Nawa, T. 2006. "The Verb *Hope* with or without the Complementizer *That*" 『六甲英語学研究』. 大阪：六甲英語学研究会.
- 大江三郎. 1988. 「非現実的願望を表す wish のあとの接続詞 that の出没」『英語語彙の諸相』. 東京：研究社.
- 岡田伸夫. 1985. 『新英文法選書 第9巻 副詞と挿入文』. 大修館書店.
- Palander-Collin, M. 1997. "A medieval case of Grammaticalization, 'methinks'," *Grammaticalization at work*, ed. by Matti Rissanen, Merja Kyto and Kirsi Heikkonen, 371-427. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Quirk, R., S. Greenbaum, G. Leech, & J. Svartvik. 1985. *A Comprehensive Grammar of English Language*. Longman.
- Storms, G. 1966. 'That-clause in modern English', *English studies* vol. 47, 249-270.
- Swan, M. 1995. *Practical English Usage 2<sup>nd</sup> ed*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Thompson, S. A and Mulac, A. 1991. "A quantitative perspective on the grammaticalization of epistemic parentheticals in English", *Approaches to grammaticalization 2*, 313-329. Amsterdam-Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Tregidgo, P. S. 1984. "I wish I was dead" *ELT*, 38/1, 48-50.
- 土屋知洋. 2008a. 「補文標識 that の有無と動詞の意味解釈 - doubt と suspect に焦点をあてて - 」英語語法文法学会 第16回大会 研究発表ハンドアウト.
- 土屋知洋. 2008b. 「発話様態動詞に見られる特異性 発話様態動詞 say からの類推と that

- 省略の可能性」『英語語法文法研究 第15巻』pp. 93-107. 開拓社：東京.
- 土屋知洋. 2009. 「ZERO-that 補文と that 補文による意味の相違 - 願望動詞 wish と hope に焦点をあてて」『JELS 26』pp.119-128. 日本英語学会編.
- 内木場努. 2003. 「I wish 構文再論」『英語語法文法研究』43-57. 東京: 開拓社.
- 渡辺登土. 1989. 『英語の語法研究・十章 実例に基づく英語語法の実証的観察』. 東京：大修館書店.
- 八木克正. 1999. 『英語の文法と語法 - 意味からのアプローチ』. 東京：研究社.
- Yaguchi, M. 2001. “The function of the non-deictic *that* in English”, *Journal of pragmatics* 33, 1125-1155.
- Yaguchi, M and Iyeiri, Y. 2007. “Use vs. non-use of the complementizer *that* in public speech”, *SJEE*, 1-16. Setsunan University press.
- 安井泉. 1981. 「補文化子 *that* の出没」『現代の英語学』. 東京：研究社.

#### [辞典とその略称]

- LDCE<sup>5</sup>: *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English 5th edition*.
- MED<sup>2</sup>: *Macmillan English Dictionary 2nd edition*.

#### [コーパスとその略称]

- BNC: *British National Corpus world edition*.
- Wordbanks: *WordbanksOnline*  
共に小学館コーパスネットワークを利用  
( <http://www.corpora.jp/~scn/information.html?page=top> )